# Numerical Simulations for Magnetohydrodynamics based on Upwind Schemes Energy vs Entropy

#### Hanbyul Jang, Dongsu Ryu

Department of Physics, School of Natural Sciences, UNIST, Korea





### Upwind schemes

Numerical methods for solving hyperbolic equations using propagation information



Robust and reliable schemes for gas dynamics

### MHD-E



 $\stackrel{\rho}{v_i}$  proper rest mass density  $p^* = p + \frac{1}{2}B^2$  total pressure

### MHD-S



 $\stackrel{\rho}{v_i}$  proper rest mass density  $p^* = p + \frac{1}{2}B^2$  total pressure

#### Jacobian matrix

$$\frac{\overrightarrow{\partial q}}{\partial t} + \frac{\overrightarrow{\partial F}}{\partial x} = \frac{\overrightarrow{\partial q}}{\partial t} + A \frac{\overrightarrow{\partial q}}{\partial x} = 0 \qquad \left( A = \frac{\overrightarrow{\partial F}}{\overrightarrow{\partial q}} = \frac{\overrightarrow{\partial F}}{\overrightarrow{\partial u}} \frac{\overrightarrow{\partial u}}{\overrightarrow{\partial q}} \right)$$

$$A = \begin{pmatrix} A_{11} A_{12} A_{13} A_{14} A_{15} A_{16} A_{17} \\ A_{21} A_{22} A_{23} A_{24} A_{25} A_{26} A_{27} \\ A_{31} A_{32} A_{33} A_{34} A_{35} A_{36} A_{37} \\ A_{41} A_{42} A_{43} A_{44} A_{45} A_{46} A_{47} \\ 0 \ 1 \ 0 \ 0 \ 0 \ 0 \\ A_{61} A_{62} A_{63} A_{64} A_{65} A_{66} A_{67} \\ A_{71} A_{72} A_{73} A_{74} A_{75} A_{76} A_{77} \end{pmatrix}$$

 $\vec{u} = \begin{bmatrix} \rho \\ v_x \\ v_y \\ v_z \\ p \\ B_y \\ B_z \end{bmatrix}$ 

parameter vector

Jacobian matrix

Eigenvalues det $(A - a_m I) = 0$  (m = 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7)Right Eigenvectors  $\overrightarrow{AR_m} = a_m \overrightarrow{R_m}$ Left Eigenvectors  $\overrightarrow{L_m} \cdot A = a_m \overrightarrow{L_m}$ 

$$LAR = \Lambda = \begin{bmatrix} a_1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & a_2 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & a_3 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & a_3 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & a_4 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & a_4 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & a_5 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & a_6 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & a_7 \end{bmatrix} \qquad \begin{array}{c} L \frac{\partial q}{\partial t} + A \frac{\partial q}{\partial x} = 0 \quad (LR = I) \\ L \frac{\partial q}{\partial t} + A L \frac{\partial q}{\partial x} = 0 \\ L \frac{\partial q}{\partial t} + A L \frac{\partial q}{\partial x} = 0 \\ R = [\overline{R_1} | \overline{R_2} | \dots | \overline{R_m}] \quad \frac{\partial w}{\partial t} + A \frac{\partial w}{\partial x} = 0 \quad (w \equiv Lq) \end{array}$$

 $\stackrel{o}{\longrightarrow} \frac{\partial w_m}{\partial t} + a_m \frac{\partial w_m}{\partial x} = 0$ 

The system decouples into m independent advection equations

#### Eigenvalues

$$\begin{split} \textbf{MHD} \quad c_s^2 &= \frac{\gamma p}{\rho} \quad b_i = \frac{B_i}{\sqrt{\rho}} \\ a_1 &= v_x - \sqrt{\frac{1}{2} [c_s^2 + b^2 + \sqrt{(c_s^2 + b^2)^2 - 4c_s^2 b_x^2}]}, \quad -\text{fa} \\ a_2 &= v_x - |b_x|, \quad -\text{Al} \\ a_3 &= v_x - \sqrt{\frac{1}{2} [c_s^2 + b^2 - \sqrt{(c_s^2 + b^2)^2 - 4c_s^2 b_x^2}]}, \quad -\text{sl} \\ a_4 &= v_x, \quad \text{er} \\ a_5 &= v_x + \sqrt{\frac{1}{2} [c_s^2 + b^2 - \sqrt{(c_s^2 + b^2)^2 - 4c_s^2 b_x^2}]}, \quad +\text{sl} \\ a_6 &= v_x + |b_x|, \quad +\text{Al} \\ a_7 &= v_x + \sqrt{\frac{1}{2} [c_s^2 + b^2 + \sqrt{(c_s^2 + b^2)^2 - 4c_s^2 b_x^2}]}, \quad +\text{fa} \end{split}$$

- -fast magnetosonic mode
- -Alfven mode
- -slow magnetosonic mode

entropy mode

- +slow magnetosonic mode
- +Alfven mode
- +fast magnetosonic mode

$$a_1(_{fast}^-) \le a_2(_{Alfven}^-) \le a_3(_{slow}^-) \le a_4(=v_x) \le a_5(_{slow}^+) \le a_6(_{Alfven}^+) \le a_7(_{fast}^+) \le a_7(_$$

### Eigenvectors

 $(\lambda + v_x)C$ 

 $Y_{y}/\sqrt{\rho}$  $Y_{s}/\sqrt{\rho}$ 



1. compressible mode

$$\beta_y = \frac{B_y}{\sqrt{B_y^2 + B_z^2}}, \quad \beta_z = \frac{B_z}{\sqrt{B_y^2 + B_z^2}}, \quad \alpha_s = \frac{\sqrt{\lambda_f^2 - c_s^2}}{\sqrt{\lambda_f^2 - \lambda_s^2}}, \qquad \alpha_f = \frac{\sqrt{c_s^2 - \lambda_s^2}}{\sqrt{\lambda_f^2 - \lambda_s^2}}$$

for fast mode

$$\begin{split} C &= \alpha_f, & Y_y = c_s \alpha_s \beta_y, & Y_z = c_s \alpha_s \beta_z, & D = \frac{b_x}{\lambda_f} = \pm \frac{\lambda_s}{c_s} sgn\left(B_x\right) \\ \text{for slow mode} & \\ C &= \alpha_s, & Y_y = -c_s \alpha_f \beta_y, & Y_z = -c_s \alpha_f \beta_z, & D = \frac{b_x}{\lambda_s} = \pm \frac{\lambda_f}{c_s} sgn\left(B_x\right) \end{split}$$

for Alfven mode

 $D = \pm sgn(B_x)$ 

$$\begin{array}{c} C \\ (\lambda + v_{z})C \\ v_{y}C - Y_{y}D \\ v_{z}C - Y_{z}D \\ v_{z}C - Y_{z}D \\ \frac{Y_{y}/\sqrt{\rho}}{Y_{z}/\sqrt{\rho}} \\ \frac{Y_{z}/\sqrt{\rho}}{\gamma - 1}c_{z}^{2})C - (Y_{y}v_{y} + Y_{z}v_{z})D \end{array} \right)^{T} \left( \begin{array}{c} \left[\frac{1}{2}(\gamma - 1)v^{2} - \lambda v_{z}\right]C + (Y_{y}v_{y} + Y_{z}v_{z})D \\ \left[\lambda - (\gamma - 1)v_{z}\right]C \\ (1 - \gamma)v_{y}C - Y_{y}D \\ (1 - \gamma)v_{z}C - Y_{z}D \\ B_{y}(1 - \gamma)C + Y_{y}\sqrt{\rho} \\ B_{z}(1 - \gamma)C + Y_{z}\sqrt{\rho} \\ (\gamma - 1)C \end{array} \right)^{T} \right)$$

#### 2. Alfven mode

 $(\lambda^2 + \lambda v_x + \frac{1}{2}v^2 -$ 

 $\overrightarrow{R} =$ 

$$\overrightarrow{R} = \begin{bmatrix} 0, \ 0, \ -\beta_z, \ \beta_y, \ \beta_z D / \sqrt{\rho}, \ -\beta_z D / \sqrt{\rho}, \ \beta_y v_z - \beta_z v_y \end{bmatrix}^T$$

$$\overrightarrow{L} = \frac{1}{2} \begin{bmatrix} \beta_z v_y - \beta_y v_z, \ 0, \ -\beta_z, \ \beta_y, \ \beta_z D \sqrt{\rho}, \ -\beta_y D \sqrt{\rho}, \ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

#### 3. Entropy mode

$$\overrightarrow{R} = \left[1, v_x, v_y, v_z, 0, 0 \underbrace{\frac{1}{2}v^2}_{2}\right]^T, \quad \left[\overrightarrow{L} = \frac{(\gamma - 1)}{c_s^2} \left[\frac{c_s^2}{(\gamma - 1)} - \frac{1}{2}v^2, v_x, v_y, v_z, B_y, B_z, -1\right]\right]$$

## Eigenvectors

$$\beta_y = \frac{B_y}{\sqrt{B_y^2 + B_z^2}}, \quad \beta_z = \frac{B_z}{\sqrt{B_y^2 + B_z^2}}, \quad \alpha_s = \frac{\sqrt{\lambda_f^2 - c_s^2}}{\sqrt{\lambda_f^2 - \lambda_s^2}}, \qquad \alpha_f = \frac{\sqrt{c_s^2 - \lambda_s^2}}{\sqrt{\lambda_f^2 - \lambda_s^2}}$$

for fast mode

 $\begin{array}{c} Y_y \sqrt{\rho} \\ Y_z \sqrt{\rho} \end{array}$ 

$$-S$$

$$C = \alpha_{f}, \qquad Y_{y} = c_{s}\alpha_{s}\beta_{y}, \qquad Y_{z} = c_{s}\alpha_{s}\beta_{z}, \qquad D = \frac{b_{x}}{\lambda_{f}} = \pm \frac{\lambda_{s}}{c_{s}}sgn(B_{x})$$
for slow mode
$$C = \alpha_{s}, \qquad Y_{y} = -c_{s}\alpha_{f}\beta_{y}, \qquad Y_{z} = -c_{s}\alpha_{f}\beta_{z}, \qquad D = \frac{b_{x}}{\lambda_{s}} = \pm \frac{\lambda_{f}}{c_{s}}sgn(B_{x})$$
mode
$$D = \pm sgn(B_{x})$$

$$\vec{L} = \frac{1}{2c_{s}^{2}} \begin{bmatrix} (c_{s}^{2}(\gamma - 1)/\gamma - \lambda v_{x}]C + (Y_{y}v_{y} + Y_{z}v_{z})D \\ -Y_{y}D \\ -Y_{z}D \\ Y_{y}\sqrt{\rho} \end{bmatrix}$$

1. compressible mode

#### 2. Alfven mode

 $\vec{R} = \begin{pmatrix} C \\ (\lambda + v_x) C \\ v_y C - Y_y D \\ v_z C - Y_z D \\ Y_y / \sqrt{\rho} \\ Y_z / \sqrt{\rho} \\ Y_z / \sqrt{\rho} \end{pmatrix}$ 

$$\overrightarrow{R} = \begin{bmatrix} 0, \ 0, \ -\beta_z, \ \beta_y, \ \beta_z D / \sqrt{\rho}, \ -\beta_z D / \sqrt{\rho}, \end{bmatrix}^T$$

$$\overrightarrow{L} = \frac{1}{2} \begin{bmatrix} \beta_z v_y - \beta_y v_z, \ 0, \ -\beta_z, \ \beta_y, \ \beta_z D \sqrt{\rho}, \ -\beta_y D \sqrt{\rho}, \ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

#### 3. Entropy mode

$$\overrightarrow{R} = \begin{bmatrix} 1, v_x, v_y, v_z, 0, 0 \\ c_s^2(1-\gamma)/\gamma \end{bmatrix}^T, \quad \overrightarrow{L} = \begin{bmatrix} 1/\gamma, 0, 0, 0, 0, 0, -1/c_s^2 \end{bmatrix}$$

#### Numerical Simulations

Total Variation Diminishing (TVD) Harten 1983 (HD), Ryu et al 1995 (MHD)

Weighted Essentially Non-Oscillatory (WENO) Jiang & Shu 1996 (HD), Jiang & Wu 1999 (MHD)

TVD(Space2-Time2)WENO3-RK3(Space3-Time3)WENO5-RK4(Space5-Time4)

#### Numerical Simulations



MHD-S

TVD\_E TVD\_S WENO3-RK3\_E WENO3-RK3\_S WENO5-RK4\_E WENO5-RK4\_S

### MHD 1D Alfven wave tests





### MHD 1D Alfven wave tests



### MHD 2,3D Alfven wave tests



#### Flux CT scheme

#### A DIVERGENCE-FREE UPWIND CODE FOR MULTIDIMENSIONAL MAGNETOHYDRODYNAMIC FLOWS

Dongsu Ryu,<sup>1</sup> Francesco Miniati,<sup>2</sup> T. W. Jones,<sup>2</sup> and Adam Frank<sup>3</sup> Received 1998 March 30; accepted 1998 July 13

$$\frac{\partial B_x}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial}{\partial y} \left( B_x v_y - B_y v_x \right) = 0 , \qquad (1)$$

and

$$\frac{\partial B_{y}}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial}{\partial x} \left( B_{y} v_{x} - B_{x} v_{y} \right) = 0 .$$
<sup>(2)</sup>

$$B_{x,i,j} = \frac{1}{2}(b_{x,i,j} + b_{x,i-1,j})$$
(3)

and

$$B_{y,i,j} = \frac{1}{2}(b_{y,i,j} + b_{y,i,j-1}) .$$
(4)

$$\bar{f}_{x,i,j} = \frac{1}{2} \left( B_{y,i,j}^{n} v_{x,i,j}^{n} + B_{y,i+1,j}^{n} v_{x,i+1,j}^{n} \right) - \frac{\Delta x}{2 \Delta t^{n}} \sum_{k=1}^{7} \beta_{k,i+1/2,j}^{n} R_{k,i+1/2,j}^{n} (5) , \qquad (6)$$

$$\bar{f}_{y,i,j} = \frac{1}{2} \left( B_{x,i,j}^{n} v_{y,i,j}^{n} + B_{x,i,j+1}^{n} v_{y,i,j+1}^{n} \right) - \frac{\Delta y}{2 \Delta t^{n}} \sum_{k=1}^{7} \beta_{k,i,j+1/2,j}^{n} R_{k,i,j+1/2}^{n}(5) .$$
(7)



= 0

and

$$b_{y,i,j}^{n+1} = b_{y,i,j}^{n} + \frac{\Delta t^{n}}{\Delta x} \left( \bar{\Omega}_{i,j} - \bar{\Omega}_{i-1,j} \right).$$
(17)

$$\oint_{S} \boldsymbol{b}^{n+1} \cdot d\boldsymbol{S} = (b_{x,i,j}^{n+1} - b_{x,i-1,j}^{n+1}) \Delta \boldsymbol{y} + (b_{y,i,j}^{n+1} - b_{y,i,j-1}^{n+1})$$
$$\Delta \boldsymbol{x} = 0 , \quad (18)$$

#### MHD Alfven wave tests





### MHD 2D Fast wave test

Periodic boundary CFL = 0.8tend = 10 $\gamma \!=\! 5/3 \!=\! 1.66666666667$  $k_x = 2\pi/xsize$  $k_{y} = 2\pi/ysize$  $n_x = n_y = 32$  (2D)  $\rho = \rho_0 + \delta \rho$  $v_{\parallel} = v_{\parallel 0} + \delta v_{\parallel}$  $v_{\perp} = v_{\perp 0} + \delta v_{\perp}$  $v_z = v_{z0} + \delta v_z$  $B_{\parallel} = B_{\parallel 0}$  $B_{\perp} = B_{\perp 0} + \delta B_{\perp}$  $B_z = B_{z0} + \delta B_z$  $p = p_0 + \delta p$ 

$$\begin{split} \rho_{0} &= 1 \\ v_{\parallel 0} = v_{\perp 0} = v_{z0} = 0 \\ B_{\parallel 0} &= 10 \\ B_{\perp 0} &= 5 \\ B_{z0} &= 0 \\ p_{0} &= 1/\gamma = 0.6 \\ c_{s0}^{2} &= \gamma p_{0}/\rho_{0} = 1 \\ \lambda &= \lambda_{fast}^{+} \end{split}$$

$$\begin{split} \delta v_{\parallel} &= 10^{-4} \cos(k_x x + k_y y) \\ \delta \rho &= \frac{\rho_0}{\lambda} \delta v_{\parallel} \\ \delta v_{\perp} &= \frac{b_{\parallel 0} b_{\perp 0}}{b_{\parallel 0}^2 - \lambda^2} \delta v_{\parallel} \\ \delta v_z &= 0 \\ \delta B_{\perp} &= -\frac{\lambda}{b_{\parallel 0}} \sqrt{\rho_0} \delta v_{\perp} \\ \delta B_z &= 0 \\ \delta P_z &= 0 \\ \delta p &= c_{s0}^2 \delta \rho \end{split}$$





x

#### MHD 2D Fast wave test





#### Flux CT scheme

#### A DIVERGENCE-FREE UPWIND CODE FOR MULTIDIMENSIONAL MAGNETOHYDRODYNAMIC FLOWS

Dongsu Ryu,<sup>1</sup> Francesco Miniati,<sup>2</sup> T. W. Jones,<sup>2</sup> and Adam Frank<sup>3</sup> Received 1998 March 30; accepted 1998 July 13

$$\frac{\partial B_x}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial}{\partial y} \left( B_x v_y - B_y v_x \right) = 0 , \qquad (1)$$

and

$$\frac{\partial B_{y}}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial}{\partial x} \left( B_{y} v_{x} - B_{x} v_{y} \right) = 0 .$$
<sup>(2)</sup>

$$B_{x,i,j} = \frac{1}{2}(b_{x,i,j} + b_{x,i-1,j})$$
(3)

and

$$B_{y,i,j} = \frac{1}{2}(b_{y,i,j} + b_{y,i,j-1}) .$$
(4)

$$\bar{f}_{x,i,j} = \frac{1}{2} \left( B_{y,i,j}^{n} v_{x,i,j}^{n} + B_{y,i+1,j}^{n} v_{x,i+1,j}^{n} \right) - \frac{\Delta x}{2 \Delta t^{n}} \sum_{k=1}^{7} \beta_{k,i+1/2,j}^{n} R_{k,i+1/2,j}^{n} (5) , \qquad (6)$$

$$\bar{f}_{y,i,j} = \frac{1}{2} \left( B_{x,i,j}^{n} v_{y,i,j}^{n} + B_{x,i,j+1}^{n} v_{y,i,j+1}^{n} \right) - \frac{\Delta y}{2 \Delta t^{n}} \sum_{k=1}^{7} \beta_{k,i,j+1/2,j}^{n} R_{k,i,j+1/2}^{n}(5) .$$
(7)



= 0

and

$$b_{y,i,j}^{n+1} = b_{y,i,j}^{n} + \frac{\Delta t^{n}}{\Delta x} \left( \bar{\Omega}_{i,j} - \bar{\Omega}_{i-1,j} \right).$$
(17)

$$\oint_{S} \boldsymbol{b}^{n+1} \cdot d\boldsymbol{S} = (b_{x,i,j}^{n+1} - b_{x,i-1,j}^{n+1}) \Delta \boldsymbol{y} + (b_{y,i,j}^{n+1} - b_{y,i,j-1}^{n+1})$$
$$\Delta \boldsymbol{x} = 0 , \quad (18)$$

## **Conclusions** Flux CT scheme $\overrightarrow{\nabla} \cdot \overrightarrow{B} = 0$



Induces numerical errors to B->E->p Serious oscillation is generated for strong B

#### Conclusions



#### In the shock regimes → MHD-E Else where → MHD-S

#### using TVD, WENO3, WENO5

#### **Conclusions** Application to Nuclear Fusion : in tokamok



No shocks, p<<E, low  $\beta$  (  $p_g \ll p_m$  )  $\longrightarrow$  MHD-S

Propagate waves many times  $\rightarrow$  small numerical dissipation



Develop Korea tokamak simulations!

# Thank you :)